

Part 9: Recommendations

9.1 Needs Analysis Space Projection

Based on the development of projected service goals representing the desired level of service that the Capital Area District Library plans to provide to patrons within its defined service area, an initial space projection analysis was prepared predicting a generally optimal level of space allocation for facilities within the CADL system. This initial optimal space projection predicted a space need of approximately 300,000 square feet of public library space, not including the additional 28,900 sf of space required to meet the needs of the central services functions that support the library's activities, programs, and services.

The initial space projection was calculated from space needs worksheets developed for each library facility that contemplate a range of space allocation for each service component including figures for an optimal, moderate, low, and minimal space allocation, along with a recommended space allocation for each service element. In general, for smaller facilities, optimal and moderate allocations were typically used where minimal economy of scale could be anticipated with the layout. Conversely, in larger facilities moderate and low allocations were typically used where a sufficient inventory would likely produce greater economy of scale in layout. The Optimal Space Projection Service Scenario of nearly 329,000 sf system-wide represents a significant increase in space from the current library setting that includes approximately 137,000 sf of space across all library facilities including central services functions and the shared spaces in select facilities where the library is housed in a municipal building and enjoys access and use of shared amenities.

Based on a review of current library facilities, it was determined that none of the existing library building locations and sites could accommodate the magnitude of projected expansion of space identified in the Optimal Space Projection Service Scenario. Thus, to achieve the projected space needs, the library would most likely need to construct all new facilities at other locations or obtain significant additional land area by acquiring adjacent parcels, where possible, to allow for major expansion of some existing libraries. Through discussions with Library officials and the Library Board, it was determined that an improvement plan that contemplates the construction of all new library facilities may be perceived as too ambitious and costly at this time, and therefore, unlikely

to receive wide community support. Recognizing that some current library facilities are relatively new, more recently updated, or in a condition that suggests they can continue to effectively serve as libraries with some improvements, an alternative service scenario was developed to reflect the site constraint realities present at some locations that limit major expansion of those facilities.

The adjusted space projection, Facility Scenario 1, allocates resources and service distribution in a slightly different way to reflect existing site constraints at several facilities, while maintaining overall system-wide service goal resource objectives. This scenario also strives to achieve a more regional distribution of resources while simultaneously preserving and enhancing the existing service configuration of thirteen facilities system-wide. Additionally, collections and other resource inventories are projected to be housed in a denser library environment than initially contemplated in the Optimal Space Projection Service Scenario to reduce the overall space requirements. For some locations with site constraints, the space needs were adjusted to more reflect the current density and quantity of the existing material resources in more of a status quo setting while at the same time, including modest expansion improvements for meeting room spaces and miscellaneous minor interior improvements. Existing site constraints have suggested a more modest expansion approach be considered for the Aurelius Library, Dansville Library, Haslett Library, and Stockbridge Library. Anticipated site constraints at the Leslie Library and Williamston Library also suggest a denser library setting to accommodate the projected increase in resources at these locations. The Facility Scenario 1 Space Projection predicts a public library space need of approximately 237,000 sf, not including the 28,900 sf required for central services for a total system-wide space projection of approximately 266,000 sf to serve the community's needs through the year 2030. The anticipated space projection continues to represent a significant increase in system-wide library space nearly doubling the current level of approximately 137,000 sf of floor area.

9.2 Preliminary Implementation Plan

The projection of space needs analysis attempts to predict an overall goal for space allocation to meet the long term needs of the library. However, frequently the Library's plan for providing expanded service is subject to further refinement in the process of developing an Implementation Plan that also takes into account other factors beyond simply the projection of space needs for library services. These factors include the realities of local planning issues and other influences along with economic considerations. The recommended Preliminary Implementation Plan for CADL's Capital Improvement Plan consists of the Facility Scenario 1 Space Projections with some adjustments to more

definitively reflect the actual anticipated size of minor expansions such as providing meeting room spaces at select facilities and other local planning considerations. As the Library Board continues to evaluate the financial feasibility of any capital improvement plan, it is assumed that the Implementation Plan may continue to be refined to balance the ultimate scope of the expansion strategy along with available funding and potential tax payer support for a funding referendum to fund the improvements. Additionally, local planning efforts and cooperation with local municipalities in identifying and securing potential sites for accommodating new or relocated facilities may continue to shape the proposed Preliminary Improvement Plan as defined today.

The proposed Preliminary Improvement Plan is recommended as follows:

- Main Library
Construct a new 72,340 sf library at the Oliver Towers site in conjunction with a new Impression 5 Science Center projected at 37,000 sf.
- Okemos Library
Construct a new 41,006 sf library at the Central Park Drive site.
- South Lansing Library
Expand into adjacent existing space and renovate the existing library to the extent possible or renovate another available existing building to achieve a 30,591 sf library in the general vicinity of the current facility.
- Holt / Delhi Library
Construct a new 29,512 sf library at a site to be determined in the triangle area in the general vicinity of the current municipal building.
- Mason Library
Construct a new freestanding 17,034 sf library on the current city hall site in conjunction with the City of Mason's construction of a new city hall and police department south of their present location, provided adequate shared parking for all facilities is available.
- Foster Library
Provide minor interior renovation to the existing 2,000 sf library. Alternatively, renovate another existing space in the general vicinity of the Foster Branch if a suitable space can be identified and secured.
- Williamston Library
Construct a new 10,619 sf library at the Grand River site acquired by the Williamston Community Library Foundation
- Leslie Library
Construct a 3,737 sf addition to the existing library including a meeting room to seat 50 for a combined 6,737 sf library at the current location.
- Haslett Library

- Construct a 1,400 sf addition to the existing library for a new meeting room to seat 50 and additional staff space for a combined 5,035 sf library at the current location. Provide an additional 25 parking spaces on the adjacent lot.
- Stockbridge Library
Construct an 800 sf addition to the existing library for a new meeting room to seat 50 for a combined 4,160 sf library at the current location.
- Webberville Library
Provide minor interior renovation to the existing 2,575 sf library and repair cracks in ceiling.
- Dansville Library
Construct a 1,000 sf addition to the existing library for a new meeting room to seat 50, entry and toilet modifications and minor renovations for a combined 2,550 sf library at the current location.
- Aurelius Library
Construct a 400 sf addition to the existing library for staff space and minor improvement for a combined 1,260 sf library at the current location.
- Central Services
Construct a new 28,887 sf facility as part of the Main Library at the Oliver Towers site and in conjunction with a new Impression 5 Science Center to be located on the same site.

The recommended Preliminary Implementation Plan outlined above includes approximately 225,500 sf of public library space not including the 28,900 sf required for central services for a total system-wide projected building area of 254,400 sf. Projected space needs for the Impression 5 Science Center, if incorporated as part of the Main Library complex, is in addition to this total and would add an anticipated 37,000 sf for a total area of 291,400 sf of space.

9.3 Project Budget

A project timeline and system-wide budget has been developed to identify anticipated costs for the proposed Preliminary Implementation Plan. The project costs have been escalated for anticipated inflationary cost increases based on the proposed project timeline that contemplates a two phase construction sequence to minimize disruption of library services throughout the service area during implementation. Following a successful funding referendum, the project timeline anticipates the design and planning

effort beginning in early 2009 and continuing through completion of the last project's construction in early 2014.

The Preliminary Project Budget forecasts the Total Project Costs for new and renovated public library space and central services functions to be approximately \$83.13 million. Additional cost considerations include an allowance for an opening day collection of \$2.5 million and approximately \$8.0 million for construction of unfinished shell space for the Impression 5 Science Center, if incorporated into the Library's Capital Improvement Plan. These additional cost considerations bring the Grand Total Project Costs to approximately \$93.6 million. Contingent on refinement of the Library's anticipated need for additional operating funds necessary to staff and operate expanded facilities, the capital improvement costs of \$93.6 million, along with additional required operating revenue, may tentatively suggest a millage increase approaching approximately 1.3 mills for twenty years. Other sources of funding including grants and donations could be contemplated to reduce any millage increase.

A Capital Improvement Plan Budget Summary follows. Detailed project budgets for each individual facility and component have been included in Appendix D of this report.

Figure 9-1a, Capital Improvement Plan Budget Summary

Capital Improvement Plan Study
Capital Improvement Plan Budget Summary -- Scenario 1, All Facilities Included

Facility	Project Scope	Projected Total SF	Approx. Bid / Const. Start date	Total Construction Costs (including Building & Site Costs and contingencies)*	Const. Costs per SF	Total Project Costs (including construction, fees, FF&E, technology, & other owner costs)*		Total Project Costs per SF
						\$	\$	
Main Library	(new construction)	72,340	mid 2011	\$ 25,550,425	\$ 353	\$	31,677,589	\$ 438
Okemos Library	(new construction)	41,006	2011	\$ 10,732,070	\$ 262	\$	13,977,750	\$ 341
South Lansing Library	(expansion and renovation-leased)	30,591	2013	\$ 2,431,015	\$ 79	\$	3,901,934	\$ 128
Holt / Delhi Library	(new construction)	29,512	mid 2012	\$ 7,662,320	\$ 260	\$	10,078,353	\$ 342
Mason Library	(new construction)	17,034	2012	\$ 4,453,265	\$ 261	\$	5,971,049	\$ 351
Foster Library	(minor renovation)	2,000	2013	\$ 102,000	\$ 51	\$	293,000	\$ 147
Williamston Library	(new construction)	10,619	mid 2011	\$ 2,887,360	\$ 272	\$	3,834,457	\$ 361
Leslie Library	(expansion and renovation)	6,737	mid 2010	\$ 1,287,405	\$ 191	\$	1,789,127	\$ 266
Haslett Library	(meeting rm. expan. and minor renov.)	5,035	mid 2012	\$ 781,450	\$ 155	\$	1,202,057	\$ 239
Stockbridge Library	(meeting rm. expan. and minor renov.)	4,160	2011	\$ 398,400	\$ 96	\$	694,044	\$ 167
Webberville Library	(minor renovation)	2,575	2010	\$ 73,200	\$ 28	\$	197,325	\$ 77
Dansville Library	(renovation and minor expansion)	2,550	mid 2010	\$ 443,500	\$ 174	\$	625,788	\$ 245
Aurelius Library	(renovation and minor expansion)	1,260	2010	\$ 170,250	\$ 135	\$	273,490	\$ 217
Central Services	(new construction, with Main / I5)	28,887	mid 2011	\$ 7,178,525	\$ 249	\$	8,613,164	\$ 298
SUBTOTAL		254,306		\$ 64,151,185	\$ 252	\$	83,129,126	\$ 327

Figure 9-1b, Capital Improvement Plan Budget Summary

Capital Improvement Plan Study
Capital Improvement Plan Budget Summary -- Scenario 1, All Facilities Included (continued)

Additional Cost Considerations

Impression 5 Science							
Center at Main	(new construction)	37,000	\$	7,364,950	\$	199	\$ 215
Opening Day Collection	(system-wide collection)	allowance			\$		2,500,000
Hazardous material investigation and abatement costs not included, unless otherwise noted. Cost to be determined, if any.							TBD

GRAND TOTAL		291,306		71,516,135		246	\$ 93,594,876	\$ 321
Central Services	(new construction, with Main / I5)	28,887	\$	7,178,525	\$	249	\$ 8,613,164	\$ 298
	(new construction, alternate site / ave)	28,887	\$	6,379,150	\$		7,711,920	
	Difference		\$	799,375	\$		901,245	
	(new construction, with Main / I5)	28,887	\$	7,178,525	\$	249	\$ 8,613,164	\$ 298
	(renovate an existing or leased space)	28,887	mid 2010	\$ 3,297,625	\$		4,378,117	
	Difference		\$	3,880,900	\$		4,235,048	

*Total costs subject to TBD amounts listed on detailed project budgets. Refer to attached for amounts To Be Determined that are not included in total project cost above. **Not included at this time: All land costs assumed donated.**

Above Costs based on a schedule assuming a February 2009 Funding Referendum with building programming commencing afterwards.

Improvement and leasing costs for temporary relocation of library facilities during improvements not anticipated and therefore not included in the above figures.

9.4 Project Cost Considerations

The Preliminary Capital Improvement Plan Project Budget to accomplish the Implementation Plan as proposed may be deemed by some to be in excess of the level of funding that the Library could effectively secure for any capital improvement project. As part of the Implementation Plan refinement process, an evaluation of options to potentially reduce costs may be necessary to achieve consensus on a financially feasible capital project budget with corresponding adjustments in the implementation plan and project scope. When contemplating options to reduce costs, trade offs are a necessary part of the process with the task often requiring making difficult decisions. Given an established budget target to meet, as library design and planning consultants, we can provide our recommendations on the best strategies to achieve any reductions in cost required, however, we also recognize that the decision making process is somewhat subjective and individuals may identify other priorities in the evaluation of various options. Through any cost consideration process we have found it beneficial to keep in mind several general principles that may be helpful in guiding decision-making by the Library with regard to project cost.

First, and perhaps to state the obvious, any reduction in cost will have some degree of impact on the Implementation Plan. In evaluating any options, it is important to keep in mind the essential basis of the overall space needs study effort—the projected space needs required to meet the long term service goals and resource inventories established to effectively deliver the desired level of collections, resources, and program services to the community through the planning horizon of 2030. While a Library may have to consider an implementation plan that fails to fully realize the projection of space needs required—often due to economic factors—the realities of such a decision typically does not alter the community's need for the anticipated level of library services and corresponding space requirements. Adjustments in the implementation plan and budget, if necessary, may possibly be made to reduce costs while still allowing the Library to achieve the projected space needs at some point in the future. Alternatively, adjustments may be contemplated that compromise the Library's ability to achieve the long term space needs in the future or a conscious decision may be made to not achieve the contemplated level of service. Regardless, it is important that decision makers understand the potential ramifications of cost decisions on the Library's underlying service goals and objectives.

Secondly, when necessary, it may be beneficial to consider any cost reduction considerations with respect to whether an item is permanently built-in verses a moveable or replaceable element. For example, one could easily add additional furnishings or

replace initial furniture with higher quality furniture in the future if funding permits. However, it is unlikely that you would re-skin a wood sided building with brick or a brick clad building with limestone. Hence, investment in bricks and mortar infrastructure construction over less permanent components such as furnishings, technology and similar items may provide an effective cost strategy consideration.

Similarly, funding the highest quality construction that the Library can reasonably afford even if it suggests building smaller buildings may provide the best long term strategy. Again, it will be easier and more cost effective to add on to a building in the future to provide additional space when deemed necessary rather than to attempt to increase the general quality of a building if and when future funding permits and as desired. Reductions in project scope that contemplate a phased construction approach should also consider the practicality of a future phase two addition to achieve the originally intended space projections. Sufficient site space for future growth as well as a general strategy for accomplishing any addition should be considered. The magnitude of a potential addition relative to the initial construction may also be a consideration. Additionally, phased construction that anticipates a future build out to a larger size usually results in a less efficient initial building as some spaces within phase one must be built to meet the needs of the full build out size contemplated as incremental expansion of each internal space is not practical or cost effective.

As a publicly funded operation, it is also important that any costs decisions do not adversely affect the long term cost effectiveness of any capital improvements. In any evaluation of cost it is imperative to consider not only the initial first costs of any capital improvement projects but also the life cycle costs over the life expectancy of the building. All too frequently, decisions to reduce costs during a capital project planning process can have a detrimental impact on the operational and replacement costs that will be experienced by the library for decades to come. As a public entity, a long term view regarding cost expenditures and life cycle cost analysis is generally viewed to be in the community's best interest.

Lastly, any cost reduction considerations should be kept in general balance to achieve an overall consistent project. For example, the quality of the architecture and the interior furnishings should be relatively consistent. A high quality building outfitted with low or lowest quality furnishings and equipment will present a general disconnect to its occupants and visitors and promote the image that the client 'ran out of money' and could not afford to complete the project appropriately.